

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

|                  |                                       |          |
|------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|
| Date: 2013-10-23 | Document: <b>ISO/DIS 15614-1:2013</b> | Project: |
|------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|

| MB/NC <sup>1</sup> | Line number | Clause/Subclause | Paragraph/Figure/Table/ | Type of comment <sup>2</sup> | Comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Proposed change                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Observations of the secretariat |
|--------------------|-------------|------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| SE                 |             | 7.6              |                         |                              | What is the reason for not allowing two new macro samples from the original test piece                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Change back or explain technical reason.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                 |
| SE                 |             | 8.3.2            | Table 8                 |                              | The change from 30 to 38 mm implies unnecessary cost for the industry (no added value). On one hand a lot of new qualifications for companies that work to product standards. On the other hand a thicker test piece is means a higher cost, especially when mechanical properties shall be tested as a complement to the fillet weld test. | Change back to 30 mm                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                 |
| SE                 |             | 8.3.2.2          | Table 7<br>Footnote a   |                              | The draft now says that a test with s and t 12 mm and no impact testing cover t24 and s12                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Amend footnote a also for the parent material range.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                 |
| SE                 |             | 8.4.2            | Para 3                  |                              | <p>Welding position has no impact on the weld properties. It is the heat input that impact the properties of the weld.</p> <p>However, the position (not welding position) where the samples shall be taken should be referenced</p> <p>It is very important to differentiate between the</p>                                               | <p>Change 3<sup>rd</sup> papagraph to</p> <p>Both hardness and impact requirements are satisfied, and no extra tests are necessary as long as the requirements for heat input in 8.4.8 is met.</p> <p>NOTE The heat input can be different for different techniques used for certain welding positions</p> <p>Amend reference to figure 5 concerning the position (not welding position!) where the samples shall be taken.</p> |                                 |
| SE                 |             | 8.3.1.4          | Table 5                 |                              | The footnotes in the draft apply to both materials compared to the current edition. This is an unnecessary restriction. It is only necessary to have a restriction for one of the materials in the material combination. See current edition and also table 6 in the draft.                                                                 | The footnotes shall only apply to one of the materials in the material combination.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                 |
| SE                 |             | 8.3.1.4          | Table 5<br>Footnote c   |                              | The current edition of ISO 15614-1 is technically correct, that for a test in group 8.2 to cover welding in group 8.1 materials                                                                                                                                                                                                             | Move group 8 from footnote c back to footnote b                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                 |

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

## Template for comments and secretariat observations

|                  |                                       |          |
|------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|
| Date: 2013-10-23 | Document: <b>ISO/DIS 15614-1:2013</b> | Project: |
|------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|

| MB/<br>NC <sup>1</sup> | Line<br>number | Clause/<br>Subclause | Paragraph/<br>Figure/<br>Table/ | Type of<br>comment <sup>2</sup> | Comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Proposed change                                                                                                                                                                                          | Observations of the<br>secretariat |
|------------------------|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| SE                     |                | 8.4.9                |                                 |                                 | It is a significant change to apply “when pre-heating is required” as in the current edition, compared to “when pre-heating is used in the test”. Further, 50 degrees lower pre-heat temperature can be devastating for the forming of defects. | Change back to be at least the pre-heat temperature used in the test, however only if pre-heat is <u>required</u> , e.g. according to a product standard or for the thickness range, see ISO/TR 17671-2. |                                    |

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **\*\***)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial